1 THE HONORABLE ADRIENNE McCOY Department 54 2 Noted for Hearing: March 4, 2024 3 With Oral Argument 4 5 6 7 IN THE SUPERIOR COURT OF THE STATE OF WASHINGTON 8 **COUNTY OF KING** 9 COLUMBIA DEBT RECOVERY, LLC, a Washington 10 limited liability company, NO. 20-2-16403-8 SEA 11 Plaintiff/ **DECLARATION OF SHARON GRACE** 12 Counterclaim-Defendant, 13 VS. 14 JORDAN PIERCE, an individual, and DONTE 15 GARDINER, an individual, 16 Defendants/ Counterclaim-Plaintiffs, 17 and 18 **GUSTAVO CORTEZ, TOWANA PELTIER and** 19 DARIUS MOSELY, 20 Third-Party Plaintiffs 21 VS. 22 23 COLUMBIA DEBT RECOVERY, LLC, a Washington limited liability company, 24 Third-Party Defendant 25 26 27

and

JORDAN PIERCE, DONTE GARDINER, THOMAS G. HELLER, MARY ASHLEY ANCHETA, BETHANY HANSON, MEGAN SHANHOLTZER, CRYSTAL PAWLOWSKI, AND TALIA LUCKEN,

Third-Party Plaintiffs,

VS.

THRIVE COMMUNITIES MANAGEMENT, LLC, a Washington limited liability company, THRIVE COMMUNITIES, INC., a Washington corporation, and BELKORP HOLDINGS, INC., a Washington Corporation d/b/a THE EDEN,

Third-Party Defendants.

I, SHARON GRACE, declare as follows:

- I am an attorney at the Law Offices of Paul Arons. I have practiced law with Mr.
 Arons since 1985, first in California, then in Washington State. Mr. Arons died on October 14,
 2023 of complications from a stroke.
- 2. I have worked with Mr. Arons for nearly 40 years and have co-counseled many cases with him. As a result, I am familiar with the time keeping and billing practices of the Law Offices of Paul Arons, and in particular, with Mr. Arons' time keeping and billing practices. It was Mr. Aron's consistent practice to keep contemporaneous time records billed in six-minute increments.
- 3. I am making this declaration on behalf of Mr. Arons in support of Defendants/Counterclaim Plaintiffs/Third-Party Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Service Awards in this litigation.
- 4. Mr. Arons was one of the attorneys of record for the Third-Party Plaintiffs in this action.

2627

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 5. According to Mr. Arons' time records, he worked on this case for approximately three and a half years. He began billing time for investigating this action on May 7, 2020 and continued billing time through September 27, 2023 for an email sent to a plaintiff in connection with the settlement.
- 6. The hours Mr. Arons recorded this matter, with reductions described below, are set forth in Exhibit 1, to this declaration. Exhibit 1 was compiled from Mr. Arons' contemporaneous time records.
- 7. In the exercise of billing judgment, it is this office's custom and practice not to record time for minor tasks, such as short telephone calls, scheduling, or reviewing short emails where a response is not required. If it is believed that too much time is taken on a task, such as reviewing or drafting a filing, time billed is reduced and recorded accordingly.
- 8. I am aware that Mr. Aron's co-counsel in this matter, Blythe Chandler, has carefully reviewed Mr. Aron's records and removed entries reflecting work on claims against only the landlords in this matter. Ms. Chandler has also reduced by appropriate percentages entries reflecting work related to claims against both CDR and the landlords. Ms. Chandler also removed entries for time that was arguably duplicative of other work done by Mr. Aron's co-counsel. I have reviewed and approved Ms. Chandler's revisions. After these billing reductions, Mr. Aron's total time is 115.416 hours.
- 9. Mr. Arons' customary rate for litigation filed in the King County Superior Court was \$550 per hour. Mr. Arons had substantial legal experience going back over forty years. This included extensive experience representing plaintiffs in class actions under the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act and related state laws, and also in challenging a number of predatory practices targeting tenants and consumers.
- 10. Mr. Arons graduated from Golden Gate University School of Law in 1978, where he was a law review writer and editor. While in school, he was a law clerk for two years in the impact litigation unit of the San Francisco Neighborhood Legal Assistance Foundation. While employed at the San Francisco Neighborhood Legal Assistance Foundation, he assisted on

3

4 5 6

7

9

8

10 11

12 13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27

several class actions successfully challenging different aspects of the California Welfare Reform Act of 1969.

- 11. After graduation, Mr. Arons began work as an associate at the law office of Gladstein & Gladstein in San Francisco. In 1981, he became a partner in the office of Gladstein & Arons, which later became Gladstein, Benjamin & Arons, which, in 1986, became the Law Offices of Paul Arons. Initially Mr. Arons focused on labor and employment law, representing plaintiffs in a wide variety of employment disputes, including those concerning, race, sex and age discrimination and wage payment. He represented individuals and labor unions on employment matters in private labor arbitrations, in administrative proceedings before the California Department of Fair Employment and Housing, the United States Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, the United States Department of Labor, the California Department of Industrial Relations, the National Labor Relations Board, and the California Unemployment Insurance Appeals Board, in hearings and jury trials in the California Superior Court and the United States District Court, and in appeals before the California Court of Appeals and Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals. Beginning in 1985, Mr. Arons co-counseled class actions pursued in both federal and state court.
- 12. Since approximately 1993 much of Mr. Arons' law practice was focused on consumer class actions filed under the Fair Debt Collection Practices Act. Notable cases that Mr. Arons co-counseled included Newman v. Checkrite California, Inc., Civ. No. 93-1557 LKK (E.D. Cal.), a seminal case in the area of FDCPA litigation against check collectors, in which a \$4.3 million settlement fund was created. The published summary judgment decision in that case, Newman v. Checkrite California, Inc., 912 F. Supp. 1354 (E.D. Cal. 1995), has been cited in over one hundred federal court decisions. Mr. Arons also represented plaintiffs in a number of other class actions filed pursuant to the FDCPA. Ballard v. Equifax Check Servs., Inc., Civ. No. S-96-1532 FCD (E.D. Cal., filed 8/26/96), was a case that involved almost 1,500,000 class members, and settled for approximately \$8,000,000. There are three published opinions arising from that lawsuit: Ballard v. Equifax Check Servs., Inc., 27 F. Supp. 2d 1201(E.D. Cal. 1998) [granting

summary judgment for the individual plaintiff], Ballard v. Equifax Check Servs., Inc., 186 F.R.D. 589 (E.D. Cal. 1999) [granting class certification], and Ballard v. Equifax Check Servs., Inc., 158 F. Supp. 2d 1163 (E.D. Cal. 2001) [granting classwide summary judgment on liability issues.] Irwin v. Mascott, Civ. No. 97-4737 JL (E.D. Cal., filed 12/31/97), was an FDCPA class action that involved approximately 600,000 class members and settled for more than a million dollars. There are four published decisions in that case: Irwin v. Mascott, 96 F. Supp. 2d 968 (N.D. Cal. 1999) [granting class certification], Irwin v. Mascott, 94 F. Supp. 2d 1052 (N.D. Cal. 2000) [denying defendants' motion to add third-party defendants], Irwin v. Mascott, 112 F. Supp. 2d 937 (N.D. Cal. 2000) [granting summary judgment and issuing permanent injunction], and Irwin v. Mascott, 370 F.3d 924 (9th Cir. 2004) [affirming contempt order against defendants]. Mr. Arons co-counseled Hunt v. Check Recovery Sys., 241 F.R.D. 505 (N.D. Cal. 2007), an FDCPA class action involving unlawful check collection charges. Plaintiffs prevailed on summary judgment. Hunt v. Check Recovery Sys. 178 F. Supp. 2d 1157 (N.D. Cal. 2007). Defendant appealed that decision to the Ninth Circuit, which referred the case to the California Supreme Court to decide the state law issue of whether a debt collector may seek both a statutory service charge, and prejudgment interest on a dishonored check. Mr. Arons argued the issue before the California Supreme Court, which ruled for plaintiffs and against the debt collector. Imperial Merchant Servs., Inc. v. Hunt, 47 Cal. 4th 381 (Cal. 2009), [97 Cal. Rptr. 3d 464]. In an interlocutory appeal in the same case, Mr. Arons succeeded in obtaining the first federal appellate court ruling that a district court has discretion to shift class notice costs to defendants, once liability is established. Hunt v. Imperial Merchant Servs., Inc., 560 F.3d 1137 (9th Cir. Cal. 2009).

13. Since becoming licensed to practice to practice law in the State of Washington in 2014, Mr. Arons represented Washington consumers in successful class actions against debt collectors. These actions included *Cavnar v. Bounceback*, 2:14-CV-235-RMP (E.D. WA) and *Dibb v. Allianceone Receivables Mgmt.*, No. 14-5835 RJB (W.D. Wash.), a class action, in which a settlement was negotiated that provided almost \$2,000,000 in direct payments and debt relief to class members. In another case involving tenant post-move out charges imposed by a

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

1	property management company, Jammeh v. HNN Associates, et al., 2:19-cv-00620 (W.D. Wash)
2	plaintiffs obtained both prospective relief for a class of tenants, and \$1,600,000 in monetary
3	relief. Mr. Arons was plaintiff's counsel in a number of other class action lawsuits and was
4	continually involved in class action litigation since 1993. A LEXIS search shows over 100 federal
5	district and appellate court decisions in cases where Mr. Arons was either lead or co-lead
6	counsel.
7	14. In approximately 2003, Mr. Arons was honored by the Impact Fund for his work
8	in Newman v. Checkrite. In 2006, Mr. Arons was honored as Consumer Advocate of the Year by
9	the National Association of Consumer Advocates. Mr. Arons participated in a number of
10	presentations at the conferences of the National Consumer Law Center, the National
11	Association of Consumer Advocates and the Northwest Consumer Law Center.
12	I declare under penalty of perjury under the United States of America that the foregoing
13	is true to the best of my knowledge, that if called as a witness I could competently testify
14	thereto, and that this declaration is executed in Friday Harbor, Washington, on this 27th day of
15	November, 2023.
16	Dun /a/ Change Curaca M/CDA #40505
17	By: <u>/s/ Sharon Grace, WSBA #48505</u> Sharon Grace, WSBA #48505
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	

DECLARATION OF SERVICE 1 2 I, Blythe H. Chandler, hereby certify that on November 27, 2023, I caused true and correct copies of the foregoing to be served via the means indicated below: 3 4 Brad Fisher, WSBA #19895 U.S. Mail, postage prepaid 5 Email: bradfisher@dwt.com Hand Delivered via Messenger Service DAVID WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP **Overnight Courier** 6 920 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3300 Facsimile 7 Seattle, Washington 98104 **Electronic Mail** Telephone: (206) 622-3150 King County Electronic Filing System 8 Facsimile: (206) 757-7700 Jeffrey I. Hasson, WSBA #23741 U.S. Mail, postage prepaid 9 Hand Delivered via Messenger Service Email: hasson@hassonlawllc.com 10 HASSON LAW, LLC **Overnight Courier** Facsimile 9385 SW Locust Street 11 Tigard, Oregon 97223 imesl Electronic Mail King County Electronic Filing System Telephone: (503) 255-5352 12 Facsimile: (503) 255-6124 13 Attorneys for Plaintiff/Counterclaim-Defendant 14 Columbia Debt Recovery, LLC 15 William H. Walsh, WSBA #21911 U.S. Mail, postage prepaid 16 Email: wwalsh@cozen.com Hand Delivered via Messenger Service Karl Neumann, WSBA #48078 **Overnight Courier** 17 Facsimile Email: kneumann@cozen.com 18 X Electronic Mail Email: krhym@cozen.com King County Electronic Filing System Email: dmargulis@cozen.com 19 Email: dbowzer@cozen.com COZEN O'CONNOR 20 999 Third Avenue, Suite 1900 21 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 340-1000 22 23 Attorneys for Third-Party Defendants Thrive Communities Management, LLC and Thrive 24 Communities, Inc. 25 26 Scott R. Weaver, WSBA #29267 U.S. Mail, postage prepaid Email: weaver@carneylaw.com Hand Delivered via Messenger Service 27

1 2	Kenneth Wayne Hart, WSBA #15511 ☐ Overnight Courier Email: hart@carneylaw.com ☐ Facsimile Email: weinberg@carneylaw.com ☐ Electronic Mail Email: fuhrmann@carneylaw.com ☐ King County Electronic Filing System
3	Email: caufman@carneylaw.com CARNEY BADLEY SPELLMAN, P.S.
4	701 Fifth Avenue, suite 3600
5	Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 607-4165
6	Facsimile: (206) 467-8215
7	Attorneys for Third-Party Defendant Belkorp Holdings, Inc., d/b/a The Eden
9	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington and the
10	United States that the foregoing is true and correct.
11	DATED this 27th day of November, 2023.
12	By: /s/ Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387
13	Blythe H. Chandler, WSBA #43387
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	

Exhibit 1

ate	Client	Cases Type	User	Activity	Description	Billable Time	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction Applied	Rate	Total Fees
05/11/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft case memo for co-counsel	1.00	1.00	50%	0.5	\$550	\$27
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call		0.40	0.40	50%	0.2	\$550	\$11
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	3	0.70	0.70	0%	0.7	\$550	\$38
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Complete initial draft of complaint.	1.20	1.20	0%	1.2	\$550	\$66
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Drafting counterclaim continued. Complete fact section and class	1.80	1.80	0%	1.8	ψSSC	ψoo
07/27/2020	Donte duranier	Litigation	r dui 7 ii olis	Diane	definition	1.00	1.00	070	1.0	\$550	\$99
08/11/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard re: filing strategy	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	7550	755
00/11/2020	Donte daramer	Litigation	r dui Arons	i none can	and motion to set aside default	0.50	0.50	070	0.5	\$550	\$16
08/27/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and revise Motion to Set Aside Default	2.30	2.30	0%	2.3	\$550	\$1,26
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		6.20	6.20	0%	6.2	7330	71,20
08/30/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	r aui Ai oiis	Diait	research and document review.	0.20	0.20	070	0.2	\$550	\$3,41
00/10/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Research collateral estoppel and res judicata re: default judgments	1.00	1.00	0%	1	7550	75,41
09/10/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	raul Alolis	Correspondence	and send brief memo to Sam Leonard and Blythe Chandler re: plan	1.00	1.00	0%	1		
					of action					\$550	\$55
00/26/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Daul Arons	Draft		1.10	1.10	50%	0.55	\$550	\$30
		Litigation	Paul Arons		Review, revise and complete first draft of counter claim		_			3330	330
09/26/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email Sam Leonard and Blythe Chandler first draft of counter claim	0.10	0.10	50%	0.05	\$550	\$2
00/20/2020	D . C .		5 14	5 6	with comments	0.40	0.10	00/	0.4	\$550	\$2
09/30/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	, and the second	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	¢EE0	ć
					motion to vacate judgment					\$550	\$5
09/30/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: further revisions to reply memo in	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	4	4-
	_				support of motion to vacate judgment					\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and revise Sam Leonard draft of reply memorandum.	2.00	2.00	0%	2	\$550	\$1,10
10/01/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Sam Leonard and Blythe Chandler re: following up on	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
					motion to vacate					\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Ç	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Blythe Chandler re: adding FDCPA claim	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft written discovery to serve on Columbia Debt Recovery	1.80	1.80	0%	1.8	\$550	\$99
11/23/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit written discovery to CDR. Exchange emails with co-	0.30	0.30	33%	0.201		
					counsel re: final changes to written discovery to Thrive and CDR					\$550	\$11
12/08/2020	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email re: dismissal of Jose Salas (deceased)	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5
03/04/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and revise meet and confer letter to Columbia Debt	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					Recovery					\$550	\$22
03/16/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Meet and confer phone call with co-counsel and counsel for	1.40	1.40	50%	0.7		
					Columbia Debt Recovery and Thrive Communities					\$550	\$38
03/16/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard to discuss	0.30	0.30	50%	0.15		
					discovery					\$550	\$8
03/17/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Further research and drafting of responses to CDR interrogatories	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
					to Gardiner					\$550	\$27
03/17/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Research	Review CDR discovery to plaintiffs and begin researching response	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	\$550	\$44
03/17/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Research		0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$16
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	7 1 6 7	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	-	
00, =0, =0==					requests to Donte Gardiner/forward to Sam Leonard for initial		1000				
					factual review and investigation					\$550	\$44
03/18/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	φοσο	Ψ
00, 10, 2021	23/1tc Garaniel	-inpation	. 441 /110113	2.010	requests to Donte Gardiner	2.00	0.00	270	0.0	\$550	\$44
03/20/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	<u> </u>	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	7550	7-17
03/23/2021	Donce Gardinel	Litigation	aui Alolis	Correspondence	comments and strategy to co-counsel	0.40	0.40	0/0	0.4	\$550	\$22
02/20/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	5,	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	0.00	۷۷۷
05/50/2021	Polite gardiner	ritigation	raui Arons	correspondence	Linan to co-counselite, rule so(b)(b) notice for CDR and other	0.10	0.10	U 70	0.1	\$550	\$5

ate	Client	Cases Type	User	Activity	Description	Billable Time	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction Applied	Rate	Total Fees
03/30/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft Rule 30(b)(6) notice for CDR, adapting notice from Jammeh v. HNN	1.00	1.00	0%	1	\$550	\$550
04/02/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
. , . ,		0.11			suggested changes/forward to Blythe Chandler					\$550	\$5!
04/29/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Sam Leonard re: discovery issue	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
				·	(bank records)					\$550	\$5.
05/19/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and revise meet and confer letter to CDR	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
05/19/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Zoom meeting with Sam Leonard, Blythe Chandler and Sarah Smith	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	\$550	\$44
05/20/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone calls with Sam Leonard/Blythe Chandler re: client status	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
05/21/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Donte Gardiner and Sam Leonard	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
05/26/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to multiple emails regarding Brad Fisher	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					complaints about our clients' discovery responses. Review Brad						
					Fisher letter and our discovery					\$550	\$22
05/27/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review Brad Fisher email re: postponing phone call, draft proposed	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
				·	response, and circulate to co-counsel					\$550	\$5
05/27/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Zoom call to meet and confer with Brad Fisher re: CDR discovery	0.00	0.00	0%	0		
					issues. No charge b/c my microphone malfunctioned					\$550	\$
05/27/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Zoom call with Beth Terrell, Sarah Smith and Sam Leonard re: CDR	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
					discovery and other issues					\$550	\$27
05/28/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and edit confirming letter to Brad Fisher re: CDR discovery	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$16
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	,	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8		
, .		0.11			pleadings					\$550	\$44
06/02/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call		0.90	0.90	0%	0.9		
		Ü			counterclaimant depositions and amending the answer					\$550	\$49
06/03/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and draft lengthy response to Bard Fisher June 2, 2021	1.20	1.20	0%	1.2		
, ,		0.11			letter re: discovery, including researching						
										\$550	\$66
06/08/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and comment on draft letter to Brad Fisher re: discovery	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Conference call with Sarah Smith, Beth Terrell, Blythe Chandler and	0.80	0.80	50%	0.4	·	
,,		0.11			Sam Leonard re: case status, discovery and planning					\$550	\$22
07/01/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence		0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
		Ü		· ·	CDR					\$550	\$5
07/02/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review emails from Brad Fisher regarding amended complaint and	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
. , . ,		0.11			exchange multiple emails with co-counsel re: how to respond.					\$550	\$5
09/02/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Deposition		1.00	1.00	0%	1		
,.,		0.11			hour for my comments and assistance to Sam Leonard.					\$550	\$55
09/06/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review CDR deposition outline and email comments to co-counsel	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call		0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$27
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	o,	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1	\$550	\$5
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call		0.90	0.90	50%	0.45	\$550	\$24
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review		0.60	0.60	50%	0.3	,	<u> </u>
10, 1 ., 2021	Donice Garanier	z.e.gae.o			comments to co-counsel	0.00	0.00	3070	0.0	\$550	\$16
10/14/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		0.50	0.50	50%	0.25	7	7
10, 1 ., 2021	Donie Garanie.	z.e.gae.o		J. a.c	counsel	0.50	0.50	3070	0.23	\$550	\$13
11/24/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call		0.90	0.90	50%	0.45	7550	713
12, 23, 2021	_ Jc Garaniei	2			briefs		1	- 0,0		\$550	\$24
12/02/2021	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		0.70	0.70	0%	0.7	7.50	7-2
12,02,2021	Some Garaniel	210,600,011	. 441 /110113	2.410	certification.	3.70	3., 0	270	,	\$550	\$38
03/02/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Conference call with co-counsel re: responding to trial court's	1.00	1.00	50%	0.5	7550	, 50
33, 32, 2022	20.10 Garaniei	60011	. 3017110713	one can	denial of motion for class certification		100	3370	10.0	\$550	\$27

ate	Client	Cases	User	Activity	Description	Billable	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction	Data	Tatal 5
		Туре				Time	1		Applied	Rate	Total Fees
03/02/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Conference call with co-counsel re: responding to trial court's	1.00	1.00	50%	0.5	4550	4075
					denial of motion for class certification					\$550	\$275
03/28/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence		0.10	0.10	50%	0.05	\$550	ćao
					settlement.					\$550	\$28
03/28/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Sam Leonard re: settlement offer and appeal.	0.10	0.10	50%	0.05	\$550	\$28
04/28/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and revise motion for discretionary review	1.50	1.50	50%	0.75	\$550	\$413
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	,	0.60	0.60	50%	0.3	\$550	\$165
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard and Blythe Chandler re: denial of	0.90	0.90	50%	0.45	7000	7-00
10, 13, 2022	Donte duramer	Litigation	1 4417 11 5115	Thoric can	discretionary review and strategy going forward.	0.50	0.50	3070	0.43	\$550	\$248
10/25/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with co-counsel re: strategy for status conference and	0.50	0.50	50%	0.25	,	, -
10/23/2022	Donte duramer	Litigation	1 4417 11 5115	Thoric can	further action	0.50	0.50	3070	0.23	\$550	\$138
11/03/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Begin discovery review to prepare for new class certification	2.00	2.00	50%	1	7000	7
11/03/2022	Donte daramer	Litigation	r dui Arons	INC VIC VV	effort/email questions to co-counsel.	2.00	2.00	3070	-	\$550	\$550
11/21/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone calls with Sam Leonard regarding responding to Thrive/CDR	0.80	0.80	50%	0.4	7330	7550
11/21/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	r aui Ai Oiis	riione can	settlement offer	0.80	0.80	30/0	0.4	\$550	\$220
01/10/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Brad Fisher re: proposed	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	7550	7220
01/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Alons	Correspondence	amended class counterclaim.	0.50	0.30	U%	0.5	\$550	\$165
01/10/2022	Donto Cardinar	Litigation	Daul Arons	Correspondence	Email co-counsel re: filing motion for leave to amend and discovery	0.10	0.10	50%	0.05	\$550	\$103
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	,	0.10	0.10	0%	0.03	\$330	Ş20
01/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Brad fisher re: stipulating to filing of 3rd Amended Counterclaim	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
01/30/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and organize prior discovery responses from CDR.	0.70	0.70	0%	0.7	\$550	\$385
01/30/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Zoom call re: CDR discovery with co-counsel	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
01/31/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Brad Fisher re: prior CDR discovery objections	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and organize prior CDR discovery responses	1.00	1.00	0%	1	\$550	\$550
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Begin draft of written summary of CDR deposition and exhibits	2.10	2.10	0%	2.1	<u> </u>	
,,					relevant to class prejudgment interest issue, with focus on						
					evidence related to compilation of class data.					\$550	\$1,155
02/03/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft second set of discovery requests for CDR, including reviewing	1.40	1.40	0%	1.4	7000	7-,
02, 00, 2020	Donite Garanier	z.c.gac.o		5.4.0	prior discovery responses in this case and Jammeh v. HNN.	20	1	0,0		\$550	\$770
02/05/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review discovery and complaint and start draft of discovery to do	1.00	1.00	0%	1	ψ330	ψίιο
02/03/2023	Donte daramer	Litigation	I dui Al Olis	Diait	list	1.00	1.00	070	-	\$550	\$550
02/06/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Begin drafting motion to compel CDR to produce documents	0.90	0.90	0%	0.9	\$550	\$495
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review some of the prior discovery and email to co-counsel re:	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	7330	Ψ133
02/00/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	raul Alolis	correspondence	discovery issues	0.40	0.40	076	0.4	\$550	\$220
02/07/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Continued drafting of motion to compel CDR to produce	1.40	1.40	0%	1.4	\$550	\$770
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Zoom call re: discovery and other issues with Sam Leonard and	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	7550	Ş770
02/07/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	raul Alons	Filone Can	Blythe Chandler	0.30	0.30	076	0.3	\$550	\$165
02/08/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft		0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	7550	7103
02/08/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	raul Alons	Diait	co-counsel	0.80	0.80	076	0.8	\$550	\$440
02/08/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review email from Jeffery Hasson, speak with Blythe Chandler,	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	,	, -
02,00,2020	Donite Garanier	z.c.gac.o		Correspondence	send responsive email to all defendants	0.10	0.10	0,0		\$550	\$220
02/09/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Complete initial researching and draft of Motion to Compel CDR	3.00	3.00	0%	3	\$550	\$1,650
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: discovery phone call and new	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1	7550	72,000
02, 17, 2023	25mc Garaniei	Ziti Bation		one can	discovery to CDR and Thrive	3.20	3.20	33/0	0.1	\$550	\$55
02/14/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Meet and confer phone call with CDR (Jeff Hasson, Brad Fisher)	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and annotate email from Brad Fisher re: document	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	- - -	7220
02/1//2023	Donle Gardiner	Litigation	r dui Ai Oils	correspondence	production/forward to Sam Leonard	0.40	0.40	0 /0	0.4	\$550	\$220

ate	Client	Cases	User	Activity	Description	Billable	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction	Poto	Total Face
/ /		Туре				Time			Applied	Rate	Total Fees
02/1//2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and incorporate Sam Leonard revisions, select and organize	2.30	2.30	0%	2.3		
					exhibits and draft supporting declaration consistent with the final					4	4
					version of the motion.					\$550	\$1,26
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft response to Brad Fisher letter about discovery responses.	1.10	1.10	0%	1.1	\$550	\$60
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Emails to counsel for Thrive and CDR re: filing a response	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1	\$550	\$5
02/27/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit final version of discovery letter to Brad Fisher and Jeffery Hasson	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
02/27/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: CDR discovery issues	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5.
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit meet and confer letter to CDR	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$16
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Jeff Hasson re: resolving	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	,	, -
		z.c.guc.o		coespoaccc	outstanding discovery disputes.					\$550	\$11
03/03/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Draft email confirming meet and confer phone call and including	0.70	0.70	0%	0.7		
					other discovery issues					\$550	\$38
03/06/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Blythe Chandler re: disovery	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2		
					order and very preliminary data results.					\$550	\$11
03/07/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Jeff Hasson re: CDR discovery	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5.
03/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Quick review of CDR discovery responses and spreadsheet and	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		
				·	review and respond to email from Sam Leonard regarding this						
					discovery					\$550	\$16
03/13/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review discovery responses and email opposing counsel to meet	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	,	, -
03/13/2023	Donte daramer	Litigation	1 441 7 11 0113	correspondence	and confer	0.20	0.20	070	0.2	\$550	\$11
03/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Blythe Chandler and Beth Terrell re: discovery status.	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$11
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Detailed review of data compilation comparing it to prior discovery		0.40	0%	0.4	7550	711
03/14/2023	Donte Gardinei	Litigation	raul Alolis	Correspondence		0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					regrading the Gardiner/Pierce discovery, and sending email to Jeff					\$550	\$22
	"			- 6	Hasson explaining that the data compilation is wrong.						
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Research and begin revised draft of motion to compel v. CDR	1.20	1.20	0%	1.2	\$550	\$66
03/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review data compilation and respond to email from Jeff Hasson re:	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		4
					scheduling meet and confer phone call.					\$550	\$16
03/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review discovery and draft notes in preparation for meet and	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
					confer phone call					\$550	\$27
03/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Draft confirming letter re: meet and confer with Jeff Hasson, and	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
					send to Jasmin Rezale for review and editing					\$550	\$27
03/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Meet and confer phone call with Jeff Hasson and Jasmin Rezale	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
03/16/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft motion to compel CDR	2.90	2.90	0%	2.9	\$550	\$1,59
03/19/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Complete initial draft of Motion to Compel v Columbia Debt	3.20	3.20	0%	3.2		
					Recovery/select and organize exhibits.					\$550	\$1,760
03/19/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review Jeff Hasson email regarding CDR's practices, review	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8		
					deposition transcript and other evidence and send response					\$550	\$440
03/20/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Conference call with Blythe Chandler and Jasmin Resale re: case	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	,	
03/20/2023	Donte daramer	Litigation	1 441 7 11 0113	i none can	status	0.50	0.50	070	0.5	\$550	\$27!
03/21/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft Declaration of Paul Arons in Support of Motion to Compel	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	7550	727
03/21/2023	Donte Gardinei	Litigation	raul Alolis	Diait	CDR Discovery	0.80	0.80	0%	0.8	\$550	\$440
02/27/2022	Danta Candinan	1:4:4:	David Assess	C	,	0.40	0.40	00/	0.1	\$550	\$55
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Sam Leonard re: case status	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	Ş5:
03/28/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Conference call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard re: case	1.10	1.10	50%	0.55	¢r.co	¢20
00/0-1			- 17		status					\$550	\$303
03/29/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review CDR opposition to motion to compel discovery, research	1.00	1.00	0%	1	1	1
					and being drafting reply brief					\$550	\$550
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to Jeff Hasson re: correct referral date for Thrive accounts	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$5
03/30/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Complete first draft of memo in reply re: Mot to Compel CDR	6.00	6.00	0%	6		
					discovery		1			\$550	\$3,30

Date	Client	Cases Type	User	Activity	Description	Billable Time	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction Applied	Rate	Total Fees
03/31/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft supplemental declaration in support of motion to compel	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review Sam Leonard's email re: interpretation of CDR spreadsheet,	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		
				·	review spreadsheet and respond.					\$550	\$165
04/05/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Jodi Nuss (TMLG), re Thrive and	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1		
, , , , , ,					CDR spreadsheet data analysis.					\$550	\$55
04/05/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard re: discovery	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
, , , , , ,					strategy and opposition to motion to deny class certification					\$550	\$275
04/06/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and analyze data and draft email with summary for Blythe	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
0.,00,2020	Donite Garanier	z.c.gac.o		correspondence	Chandler	0.50	0.50	0,0	0.5	\$550	\$275
04/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence		0.60	0.60	0%	0.6		
0., 10, 2020	Donite Garanier	z.c.gac.o		correspondence	compliance, confirming agreement and identifying issues.	0.00	0.00	0,0	0.0	\$550	\$330
04/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Blythe Chandler : key word	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	7550	7550
04/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	r aui Aiolis	Correspondence	search terms.	0.10	0.10	070	0.1	\$550	\$55
04/10/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence		0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	7550	755
04/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	raul Alolis	Correspondence	forward to Blythe Chandler for review	0.30	0.30	078	0.3	\$550	\$165
04/10/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Daul Arons	Meeting	Phone call with Mark Case (CDR), Jeff Hasson and Blythe Chandler	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	7550	7103
04/10/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	, , ,	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
04/44/2022	Danta Candinan	114141	Davil Avana	Discuss Call	re: CDR discovery order	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call /w Sam Leonard re: CDR discovery issues.	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from potential plaintiff v. CDR					\$550	\$110
04/13/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review, research and respond to email from Brad Fisher re: word	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	ć==0	6110
		1			limits and filing deadlines for CDR's motion.					\$550	\$110
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Research substituting class plaintiff and send email to co-counsel.	1.20	1.20	0%	1.2	\$550	\$660
04/13/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Blythe Chandler re: CDR request	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
					for extension.					\$550	\$55
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Review and respond to emails from potential plaintiff	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
04/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Draft email confirming substance of meet and confer phone call	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					with CDR					\$550	\$220
04/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with potential plaintiff	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
04/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone cail with Jeff Hasson, Mark Case and Sam Leonard re:	1.10	1.10	0%	1.1		
					discovery issues					\$550	\$605
04/14/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: CDR discovery issues	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
04/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Continued drafting of motion to amend, including analysis of	2.00	2.00	0%	2		
					Gustov Cortez facts.					\$550	\$1,100
04/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Begin drafting motion for leave to amend.	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
04/16/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Complete drafting of 5th Amended Counterclaim	1.20	1.20	0%	1.2	\$550	\$660
04/17/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and draft factual allegations	0.60	0.60	0%	0.6		
					for new class plaintiffs					\$550	\$330
04/17/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review edits to motion for leave to amend made by Blythe	1.80	1.80	0%	1.8		
0 1, -1, -0-0					Chandler and Sharon Grace and begin revising the motion.					\$550	\$990
04/18/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Revise motion for leave to file amended complaint	1.70	1.70	0%	1.7	\$550	\$935
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Review various emails regarding scheduling of motions to deny	0.90	0.90	30%	0.63	7,000	7000
04/10/2023	Donce duramer	Litigation	l dui / li olis	Thoric can	class certification and have conference call with co-counsel re: how		0.50	3070	0.03		
					to respond.					\$550	\$347
04/18/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Further revisions to motion for leave to amend	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to co-counsel re: motion for leave to amend	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$55
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Revise complaint to make it consistent with motion for leave to	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	7550	733
04/10/2023	Donce Gardiner	Litigation	raui Alulis	Diait	·	0.40	0.40	0/0	0.4	\$550	\$220
04/19/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Daul Arons	Correspondence	amend Email to CDB council you production of data compilation	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
		Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to CDR counsel re: production of data compilation.		0.10	0%		\$550	\$55
04/20/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard to discuss CDR discovery issues and	0.30	0.30	U%	0.3	4550	64.65
					motion to deny class cert.					\$550	\$165

ate	Client	Cases Type	User	Activity	Description	Billable Time	Total Time	Reduction	Reduction Applied	Rate	Total Fees
04/20/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and revise motion for leave to file motion for leave to file	1.60	1.60	0%	1.6		
					amended complaint and supporting declaration.					\$550	\$880
04/20/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Draft email to Jeff Hasson re: compliance with discovery order	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
04/21/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Jeff Hasson re: CDR compliance with discovery	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		
					order.					\$550	\$165
04/21/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: CDR compliance with discovery	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		
					order.					\$550	\$165
04/21/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review discovery and email Sam Leonard re: interest charges	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
04/24/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to emails from Jeff Hasson and co-counsel re:	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5		
					stipulation to extend time/draft stipultion to extend time and						
					circulate to co-counsle					\$550	\$275
04/24/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Jeff Hasson arguing about	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2		
					language in the Stipulation Extending Time for CDR to Comply with						
					Discovery Order					\$550	\$110
04/24/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email co-counsel about potential call rep who is paid in full	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: CDR data and responding to	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	,	,
0 1, 2 1, 2020	Donice Garanie.	z.c.gucio			motion to deny class certification	0.20	0.20	0,0	0.2	\$550	\$110
04/25/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to Brad Fisher proposal for concession in	0.60	0.60	0%	0.6	7000	7
04/23/2023	Donte daramer	Litigation	I dui Alons	Correspondence	response to our request for a continuance.	0.00	0.00	070	0.0	\$550	\$330
04/25/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Review Blythe Chandler email call here re: Brad Fisher proposal for	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	7550	7550
04/23/2023	Donte Gardinei	Litigation	raul Alolis	Filone Can	concessions in response to our request for a continuance.	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
04/25/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Mooting		0.60	0.60	50%	0.3	7550	7110
04/25/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom meeting with Blythe Chandler, Amanda Steiner and Sam	0.60	0.60	50%	0.3	\$550	\$165
04/26/2022	Danta Candinan	1:4:4:	David Assess	C	Leonard to discuss motions to deny class certifictation	0.20	0.20	00/	0.2	\$550	\$105
04/26/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to co-counsel re: phone call from Brad Fisher re: extension of	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2		
					time. CDR person handling data compilation has left. Is proposing						
					June 9 and hearing date, push back motion to amend one week,					4	4
					and extend discovery to May 19.					\$550	\$110
04/26/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call from Jeff Hasson re: phone call from Brad Fisher re:	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1		
					extension of time. CDR person handling data compilation has left.						
					Is proposing June 9 and hearing date, push back motion to amend						
					one week, and extend discovery to May 19.					\$550	\$55
04/26/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Email to CDR counsel and counsel for all parties re: continuance	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1	\$550	\$55
05/15/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review supplemental CDR court-ordered discovery responses,	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					compare with existing data and forward comments to co-counsel					\$550	\$220
05/24/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit opposition to CDR Motion to Deny Class	0.60	0.60	0%	0.6		
					Certification.					\$550	\$330
05/24/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: opposition to CDR Motion to Deny	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3		
					Class Certification.					\$550	\$165
05/25/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit revised opposition to CDR Motion to Deny Class	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4		
					Certification.					\$550	\$220
06/12/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit revisions to proposed findings of fact and	0.50	0.50	33%	0.335		
					conclusions of law for Thrive/Belkorp/CDR Motions to Deny Class						
					Certification					\$550	\$184
06/23/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom meeting with co-counsel re: strategy with CDR and Thrive	1.00	1.00	50%	0.5	1	,
00, 23, 2023	Donte duranier	Litigation	1 4417 (10115	Meeting	orders	1.00	1.00	3070	0.5	\$550	\$275
06/23/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Draft short memo for Zoom meeting with co-counsel re: strategy	0.20	0.20	50%	0.1	7550	Ψ_/3
50, 25, 2025	Donic Garaniei	Litigation	aui Ai oils	Diait	with CDR and Thrive orders	0.20	0.20	3070	0.1	\$550	\$55
06/28/2022	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review email from Blythe Chandler re CDR class motion and	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	-	755
	iponte Garuniei	LIUgation	r aui Ai UllS	Leonespondence	ineview email from blythe chandler re CDN class motion and	0.30	0.30	U / 0	0.5		ı

Date	Client	Cases Type	User	Activity	Description	Billable Time	Total Time	Reduction		Rate	Total Fees
06/28/2023	Donte Gardiner	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard re: CDR settlement and class certification	0.50	0.50	0%	0.5	\$550	\$275
06/29/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Emails with co-counsel re: settlement offer letter and phone calls to plaintiffs	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
06/30/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review email from Jeff Hasson and email co-counsel re: response	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
07/10/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Revise stipulation to stay proceedings and sent to CDR counsel for review	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
07/10/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to Jeff Hasson email re: stipulation	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
07/10/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom call with Blythe Chandler and Sam Leonard re: settlement proposal	0.60	0.60	0%	0.6	\$550	\$330
07/10/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom call re: settlement with Jeff Hasson, Mark Case, Blythe Chandler, Sam Leonard	0.70	0.70	0%	0.7	\$550	\$385
07/11/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review and respond to email from Blythe Chandler re: response to Jeff Hasson in connection with CDR settlement	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
07/12/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard to analyze CDR interest data	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
07/12/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review and respond to email from Sam Leonard re: CDR revised damage calculations	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
07/12/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review email from Jeff Hasson re: RCW 19.16.450 and Fireside, review case and email co-counsel re: settlement discussions	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
07/13/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Recompile CDR damages list from CDR1789 and send to Blythe to use in settlement communication with CDR.	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
07/13/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom call with Sam Leonard and Blythe Chandler re CDR damage calculations	1.10	1.10	0%	1.1	\$550	\$605
07/18/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Review email from Jeff Hasson re: CDR settlement and send comments to co-counsel	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
07/18/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Meeting	Zoom meeting with Jeff Hasson, Mark Case and Blythe Chandler to discuss CDR settlement	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
07/19/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review settlement agreement drafted by Blythe Chandler and email comments	1.00	1.00	0%	1	\$550	\$550
07/28/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Discuss CDR settlement offer Mosley, Peltier and Cortez.	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
08/01/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review renewed settlement email from Jeff Hasson and forward to co-counsel with comments	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
08/01/2023		Litigation	Paul Arons	Review	Review Blythe Chandler's proposed response to Jeff Hasson settlement email, review RCW 19.16.450 cases, and respond to	0.30	0.30	0%	0.3	\$550	\$165
08/02/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Blythe's email Review email from Jeff Hasson re: proposal to excluded BK accounts and forward comments to co-counsel	0.10	0.10	0%	0.1	\$550	\$55
08/09/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Sam Leonard re: CDR settlement offer	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
08/11/2023		Litigation	Paul Arons	Correspondence	Emails to plaintiffs re: CDR settlement offer	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
08/16/2023		Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review and edit CDR settlement agreement	0.40	0.40	0%	0.4	\$550	\$220
08/18/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Phone Call	Phone call with Blythe Chandler re: negotiating settlement agreement with CDR	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
09/13/2023	3	Litigation	Paul Arons	Draft	Review Jeff Hasson notes on settlement docs and forward comments to co-counsel	0.20	0.20	0%	0.2	\$550	\$110
						126.20	1		115.416		\$63,479